

Northeast Consortium

University of New Hampshire

University of Maine

Massachusetts Institute of Technology

Woods Hole Oceanographic Institution

December 19, 2011

Capt. Paul Howard
Executive Director
New England Fishery Management Council
50 Water Street
Newburyport, MA 01950

Dear Capt. Howard,

The Northeast Consortium has facilitated an independent technical evaluation of the collaborative research project:

“A collaborative effort to examine new strategies for managing closed bottom habitats for sea scallops.”

This project received funding from the Northeast Consortium in FY2006 (\$143,625) to study the efficacy of closed areas with respect to enhancement of wild sea scallops and determine the best methods to collect, handle, transport, and deploy wild sea scallops. Dr. Brian Beal of the University of Maine at Machias led the project in partnership with several scallop fishermen, Terry Stockwell of the Maine Department of Marine Resources, and Chris Bartlett of Maine Sea Grant.

I am pleased to submit the evaluation documents to the New England Fishery Management Council. This includes the final report and two evaluation reports.

The Review:

The evaluation served as a formal assessment of the project. Two independent scientists each conducted a mail review of the project, providing comments and suggestions, which while occasionally critical, were made with the intent to improve the research, applications of the data, and future research. The reviewers were asked to focus on the final report, but supporting documents were included in the review package to give further perspective on the project. The evaluation reports were sent to Dr. Beal in December, 2011. Although he will not be submitting a written response at this time, he may be contacted for questions.

Evaluation Criteria:

The evaluation criteria are listed in the enclosed document that describes the Northeast Consortium evaluation process. Reviewers were asked to focus on the second criteria, certification of results, i.e. whether the experimental design was appropriate and if the conclusions are well supported by the data.

Conflict of Interest and Confidentiality:

Each reviewer signed the Northeast Consortium's conflict of interest and confidentiality policy for the technical evaluation of projects. The evaluation reports submitted do not necessarily reflect views of the Northeast Consortium, the reviewers' employers, or governments. The review comments are being submitted to the Council anonymously. However, I am always willing to act as a liaison for questions of the reviewers regarding any aspect of the evaluations.

The Northeast Consortium values this collaborative research project and the contributions that it can make to fisheries management and our collective knowledge of the Gulf of Maine and Georges Bank ecosystem. Thank you in advance for your consideration and assistance in ensuring the appropriate use of the study and the evaluation reports in the management arena. Do not hesitate to contact me with any questions you may have.

Sincerely,



Rachel Gallant Feeney
Communications and Information Coordinator
603-862-2276
rachel.feeney@unh.edu

CC:

Phil Haring, NEFMC
Chris Glass, Northeast Consortium

Enclosures:

- The Northeast Consortium's guidelines for the final technical evaluation for collaborative research projects, including evaluation criteria.
- Beal, B. F. "A collaborative effort to examine new strategies for managing closed bottom habitats for sea scallops." Final report submitted to the Northeast Consortium, June 2009.
- "Technical evaluation report." Submitted to the Northeast Consortium May 6, 2011.
- "Technical evaluation report." Submitted to the Northeast Consortium December 15, 2011.